



**REQUEST FOR COMMISSION ACTION**  
**CITY OF INDEPENDENCE**  
**March 28, 2019**

**Department** Administration

**Director Approval** Kelly Passauer

**AGENDA ITEM** Consider bids received for 1916 City Hall Renovation – Phase I.

**SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION** Award base bid plus add alternates to Hoefer & Hoefer in the amount of \$1,105,400.

**BACKGROUND** K. Vance Kelley with TreanorHL has reviewed the bids that were received on February 12, 2019 from three contractors for the 1916 City Hall Renovation – Phase I. TreanorHL’s recommendation is to award the base bid plus add alternates 1, 2, 3 & 5 to Hoefer & Hoefer in the amount of \$1,105,400.

**BUDGET IMPACT** The total contract amount with Hoefer & Hoefer will be \$1,105,400 which is less than the original estimate of \$1,286,986. Sufficient funds are available from the Special Use Sales Tax fund for City Facilities and ADA improvements.

**SUGGESTED MOTION** I move to award the base bid plus add alternates to Hoefer & Hoefer in the amount of \$1,105,400 for 1916 City Hall Renovation – Phase I.

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS** Recommendation from TreanorHL

# TREANORHL

March 21, 2019

Craig Whitehead, City Manager  
City of Independence  
811 West Laurel Street  
Independence, Kansas 67301

Re: City Hall Renovation Phase I – Bid Tabulation and Recommendations  
Project #HP0559.0001.00

Dear Mr. Whitehead:

We have reviewed the bid tabulation from the bid opening for the City Hall Renovation Phase I project on February 12, 2019, and are providing our recommendations. PSI has provided their thoughts and recommendations for the abatement portion of the project in the attached letter. The prime bidders' Base Bids are discussed below, with general discussion of the alternates effect on these bids. For more detailed information on the alternates, see the attached full bid tabulation.

#### Base Bid

Home Center Construction	\$1,182,000.00
Hoefer & Hoefer	\$ 969,000.00
Decker Construction	\$ 985,000.00

#### Base Bid + All Add Alternates

Home Center Construction	\$1,354,700.00
Hoefer & Hoefer	\$1,105,400.00
Decker Construction	\$1,123,400.00

We recommend the low base bid from Hoefer & Hoefer be accepted by the City of Independence. In addition to this, we recommend the City include Add Alternates No. 1, No. 2, No. 3 & No. 5 which are associated with increased project quality. Therefore, the total contract amount with Hoefer & Hoefer will be \$1,105,400. This is less than our original estimate of \$1,286,986.

None of the three bidders were able to get pricing from suppliers in time for the bid for Alternate No. 4 (aluminum clad windows).

Bids were offered by the three prime bidders for the Deduct Alternates Nos. 6 thru 8, with the exception of Decker Construction providing no bid for Alternate No. 7 (fixed windows in lieu of operable windows). We do not recommend the City accept deduct alternates No. 6 & 8, as they provide cost savings at the expense of quality for the project.

Deduct Alternate No. 7, for fixed windows in lieu of operable windows, however, merits further discussion. Fixed windows often enhance energy efficiency and address issues with security for a project like this. Many governmental clients prefer fixed windows over the traditional operable window. This is especially true if the MEP systems in the building are modern and provide automatic heating and air conditioning temperature



control. Hoefer & Hoefer has offered a \$27,500 savings for accepting this Deduct Alternate. Therefore, we believe the City should discuss whether this option is appropriate.

The only item of concern with the bid results is the length of time to complete the project.

<u>Completion Time</u>	<u>Base Bid</u>	<u>w/Add Alternates</u>
Home Center Construction	240 days (8 mo)	270 days (9 mo)
Hoefer & Hoefer	283 days (9.5 mo)	427 days (14 mo)
Decker Construction	300 days (10 mo)	300 days (10 mo)

The completion times provided for the base bid work are higher than our anticipated 3-6 months of construction. A completion time of over a year is unusual in our experience with the scope of work included in the project. We contacted the three prime bidders to gain clarity on the items included in their bids, and how this may have affected the completion times they offered. It appears the contractors were concerned about the long lead time for the windows. They also preferred to finish all of the exterior masonry repairs and repointing before installing new windows. Hoefer & Hoefer mentioned that they can have shop drawing submittals for the windows ready to go and to TreanorHL for review as soon as a notice to proceed was received. If this long construction period is a concern with the City, we can discuss with Hoefer & Hoefer the possibility of completing the masonry restoration in its entirety on each elevation and installing windows immediately as each elevation is completed. This might shorten the overall construction period. TreanorHL will provide an adjustment to our contract to align with the longer construction period to include the additional Contract Administration time required from us beyond the 4 site visits originally planned. This will include additional monthly site visits and site visit reports to accompany the monthly pay application reviews.

In summary, it is our recommendation that the City approve Hoefer & Hoefer for the project, and that add Alternates Nos. 1, 2, 3, & 5 be approved for added quality & longevity. (Excluding Alternate No. 4 for which there were no bids from all three bidders.) We do not recommend taking Alternates No. 6 & 8 as they are cost-savings alternates that decrease the overall quality of the project. We believe that Alternate No. 7 for fixed windows in lieu of operable windows merits discussion, as there are energy and security implications in choosing which window type to utilize for the project.

Sincerely,



K. Vance Kelley, AIA  
PRINCIPAL

719 SW Van Buren Street, Suite 200  
Topeka, KS 66603

vkelly@treanorhl.com

c 785.221.3748  
o 785.235.0012  
d 785.350.6504

Enclosures

Cc: File

treanorhl.com



Independence City Hall Renovation - Phase I

2/12/2019

Bidder	Base Bid	Alternates															
		Alt. 1		Alt. 2		Alt. 3		Alt. 4		Alt. 5		Alt. 6		Alt. 7		Alt. 8	
		Full Brick Repoint	Add/Sub Days	Lead T-Cap Installation	Add/Sub Days	Basement Window Lintel Replacement	Add/Sub Days	Aluminum-Clad Windows	Add/Sub Days	Reglets at Roof Wall Flashing	Add/Sub Days	Cap at Air Shaft in Lieu of Skylight	Add/Sub Days	Fixed Windows in Lieu of Operable Windows	Add/Sub Days	TPO Roofing in Lieu of SBS Mod-Bit Roofing	Add/Sub Days
Home Center Construction	\$1,182,000.00	\$101,300.00	30	\$31,000.00		\$36,000.00		No Bid		\$4,400.00		(\$12,000.00)		(\$9,500.00)		(\$10,250.00)	
Hoefer & Hoefer	\$969,000.00	\$74,400.00	90	\$17,850.00	30	\$39,350.00	14	No Bid		\$4,800.00	10	(\$6,500.00)		(\$27,500.00)		(\$10,266.00)	
Decker Construction	\$985,000.00	\$97,500.00		\$5,400.00		\$31,600.00		No Bid		\$3,900.00		(\$22,000.00)		No Bid		(\$12,000.00)	

Independence City Hall I

2/12/2019

BID RESULTS

Bidder	Unit Pricing										Bid Bond (Y/N)	Completion Time (Calendar Days)
	Unit Price 1 Concrete Roof Deck Repair (SF)	Unit Price 2 Concrete Roof Deck Crack Repair (LF)	Unit Price 3 Brick Masonry Repair (SF)	Unit Price 4 Brick Masonry Repointing (LF)	Unit Price 5 Terra Cotta Patching (SF)	Unit Price 6 Terra Cotta Glaze Repair (SF)	Unit Price 7 Terra Cotta Mortar Repointing (LF)	Unit Price 8 Stone Masonry Repair (CF)	Unit Price 9 Stone Masonry Repointing (LF)	Unit Price 10 Frame Remv., Salv. & Reinst. (ea)		
Home Center Construction	\$130.00	\$40.00	\$350.00	\$12.00	\$550.00	\$58.00	\$9.00	\$550.00	\$6.00	\$620.00	Y	240
Hoefer & Hoefer	\$15.00	\$40.00	\$255.00	\$13.50	\$112.00	\$64.00	\$13.75	\$540.00	\$10.50	\$200.00	Y	283
Decker Construction	\$20.00	\$25.00	\$80.00	\$5.00	\$80.00	\$57.00	\$5.00	\$80.00	\$5.00	\$500.00	Y	300